Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of ideas

INPP, Hong Kong
4th October 2018

Bill Fulford
St Catherine’s College, Oxford
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of ideas

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
2) The importance of internationalism
3) An open society of ideas
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of ideas

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
2) The importance of internationalism
3) An open society of ideas

Conclusions: The challenge of pluralism
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of ideas

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
2) The importance of internationalism
3) An open society of ideas

Conclusions: The challenge of pluralism
Karl Jaspers
philosopher and psychiatrist

The author of General Psychopathology
Psychiatry’s First Biological Phase …

- Brain pathology
- Differential staining
- Bacteriology
Psychiatry’s First Biological Phase …

- Brain pathology
- Differential staining
- Bacteriology

- Alzheimer’s disease
- Neurosyphilis
‘...quite fantastical ...’
Psychiatry’s First Biological Phase

also

Psychiatry’s First Philosophical Phase
1990s

Psychiatry’s Second Biological Phase

The world’s first brain prosthesis

A chip has been made that mimics the hippocampus. Could it one day replace damaged brain tissue?
1990s

Psychiatry’s Second Biological Phase

also

Psychiatry’s Second Philosophical Phase
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry since 1990

- Over 40 New Groups Around the World
- Sections in WPA and EPA
- International Network for Philosophy and Psychiatry (launched Cape Town, 2002); Hong Kong conference (2018)
- New ‘Chairs’ (UK, Netherlands, Italy, South Africa)
- Training Programmes and Research (Europe and South America)
- ~ Oxford philosophy (£2m endowment for a Tutorial Fellowship)
- International Journal: PPP (Philosophy, Psychiatry, & Psychology)
- International Book Series: IPPP (over 50 volumes)
- Oxford International Summer Schools (2013/15/17)
- Philosophy into practice
  ~ Phenomenology, psychopathology and neuroscience
    ~ Responsibility without blame
    ~ Values-based practice
A Key Difference

1913
Psychiatry’s First Philosophical Phase was Just a Phase

1990
Psychiatry’s Second Philosophical Phase is Still in Full Swing!
Why the Difference?

1913
Psychiatry’s First Philosophical Phase was Localised

1990
Psychiatry’s Second Philosophical Phase is International
International Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry since 1990

- Over 40 New Groups Around the World
- Sections in WPA and EPA
- International Network for Philosophy and Psychiatry (launched Cape Town, 2002); Hong Kong conference (2018)
- New ‘Chairs’ (UK, Netherlands, Italy, South Africa)
- Training Programmes and Research (Europe and South America)
  ~ Oxford philosophy (£2m endowment for a Tutorial Fellowship)
- International Journal: PPP (Philosophy, Psychiatry, & Psychology)
- International Book Series: IPPP (over 50 volumes)
- Oxford International Summer Schools (2013/15/17)
- Philosophy into practice
  ~ Phenomenology, psychopathology and neuroscience
    ~ Responsibility without blame
    ~ Values-based practice
INPP Conferences

- Brazil, Bulgaria, Chile,
- Finland, France, Germany
- Italy, Netherlands, New Zealand, Portugal
- South Africa, Spain, Sweden
- UK and USA
INPP Conferences
2018 China

• Brazil, Bulgaria, Chile,
• Finland, France, Germany
• Italy, Netherlands, New Zealand, Portugal
• South Africa, Spain, Sweden
• UK and USA
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of Ideas

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
2) The importance of internationalism
3) An open society of ideas

Conclusions: The challenge of pluralism
To anticipate …

- Internationalism is important clinically
To anticipate …

• Internationalism is important clinically
• It provides a defence against abuses of psychiatry
To anticipate …

- Internationalism is important clinically
- It provides a defence against abuses of psychiatry
- By sustaining an open society of ideas
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

- 1960s/70s
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

- 1960s/70s
- Psychiatric diagnoses used to justify sending political dissidents to prison camps
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

- 1960s/70s
- Psychiatric diagnoses used to justify sending political dissidents to prison camps
- UK/USA attributed to poor standards of Soviet psychiatric science
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E.

Concepts of Disease and the Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

British Journal of Psychiatry, 162, 801-810
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993

Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E.

• Visiting Russian psychiatrist
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993
Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E.

- Visiting Russian psychiatrist
- Ordinary language philosophical study of the Russian language scientific publications from the 1960s/70s
J. L. Austin

Ordinary language philosophy (‘Oxford School’) ...
J. L. Austin

Ordinary language philosophy (‘Oxford School’) …

focuses on ordinary (ie everyday) language use in case studies, professional publications, etc
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993
Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E
FINDINGS:
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993
Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

FINDINGS:
USSR and UK/USA
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993
Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

FINDINGS:
USSR and UK/USA
• Same symptoms
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

FINDINGS:
USSR and UK/USA

• Same symptoms
• Same diagnostic concepts
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993
Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

FINDINGS:
USSR and UK/USA

• Same symptoms
• Same diagnostic concepts
• Same biological model
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993

Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

CONCLUSIONS
CONCLUSIONS

USSR using

• Same science
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993

Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

CONCLUSIONS

USSR using

- Same science
- Different criteria of rationality
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

1993

Fulford, K.W.M., Smirnov, A.Y.U. and Snow, E

CONCLUSIONS

USSR using

- Same science
- Different criteria of rationality
- Different values
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

- 1960s/70s
- Psychiatric diagnoses used to justify sending political dissidents to prison camps
- Not due to poor science
Abuse of Psychiatry in the USSR

- 1960s/70s
- Psychiatric diagnoses used to justify sending political dissidents to prison camps
- Not due to poor science but to lack of awareness of values driving diagnosis
Vulnerability of Psychiatry to Abuse

- Historically
- Many other countries
  (Geneva Initiative for Psychiatry)
Vulnerability of Psychiatry to Abuse

- Historically

- Many other countries (Geneva Initiative for Psychiatry)

- Including UK
Abuse of Psychiatry in UK?

2014
Scott Weich et al.,
Variation in compulsory psychiatric inpatient admission in England: a cross-sectional, multilevel analysis.
Health Services and Delivery Research: Vol 2, No 49
Abuse of Psychiatry in UK?

2014
Scott Weich et al.,

Key finding …
Administrative boundaries a major determinant of rates of compulsory psychiatric treatment
Critique of psychiatric science

From DSM 5 to RDoC?

Thomas R. Insel, M.D.
NIMH Director
Critique of psychiatric science

From DSM 5 to RDoC?

But not looking at diagnostic values

Thomas R. Insel, M.D.
NIMH Director
Values everywhere in DSM

2005

John Sadler
*Values and Psychiatric Diagnosis*
Oxford: Oxford University Press
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of ideas

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
2) The importance of internationalism
3) An open society of ideas

Conclusions: The challenge of pluralism

The USSR study points directly to the need for an open society of ideas.
It shows we need great science ...
But that we need values too ...
Many other pointers …
Paul Hoff’s historical pointer

- The history of psychiatry is ... a history of ‘serial collapses into single message mythologies’

Hoff, P. *Die psychopathologische Perspektive* 2005
Jim Birley’s pointer …

As President of the Geneva Initiative for Psychiatry

Called for

‘An Open Society of Ideas’
valuesbasedpractice.org

Collaborating Centre for Values-based Practice in Oxford
Values-based Practice International

Collaborations across:

- China
- Europe/North America
- Japan
- South Africa
- South America
Developments in Philosophy and Psychiatry: Towards an Open Society of ideas

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
2) The importance of internationalism
3) An open society of ideas

Conclusions: The challenge of pluralism
A Golden Thread

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
   Pluralism

2) The importance of internationalism
   Pluralism

3) An open society of ideas
   Pluralism
The Challenge of Pluralism

1) Internationalism in philosophy and psychiatry
   Essentially pluralistic – Oxford’s ‘values-based practice international’

2) The importance of internationalism
   Failure of pluralism drives abusive practices – Paul Hoff’s ‘serial collapses into single message mythologies’

3) An open society of ideas
   Pluralism as the basis of good practice – Jim Birley’s call for an ‘open society of ideas’
Isaiah Berlin on values

Professor of Social and Political Philosophy

• Our default position is monism
Isaiah Berlin on values

Professor of Social and Political Philosophy

• Our default position is monism
• The challenge of pluralism
Max Planck on science

‘New sciences aren’t born …
Max Planck on science

‘New sciences aren’t born …

… old scientists die!’
The Challenge of Pluralism for the Next Generation

‘to boldly go …’
The Challenge of Pluralism for the Next Generation

‘to boldly go …’

…towards an open society of ideas